

# **FINAL REPORT**

## **Transportation Needs for an Economically Prosperous Buffalo-Niagara Region – Phase II**

A Report Produced for the GBNRTC Planning and  
Coordinating Committee

**March 2001**

**By  
Greater Buffalo Niagara Regional Transportation Council  
and  
Empire State Development-Western New York Region**

## **ABOUT THIS REPORT**

This document represents the second phase of work accomplished through a collaborative effort of the Greater Buffalo-Niagara Regional Transportation Council (GBNRTC) and Empire State Development Corporation (ESDC). This partnership recognizes the important relationship between economic development and transportation infrastructure investment, and the need to continually coordinate such planning work in Western New York (WNY).

Phase I of the partnership was completed in June 2000 and was highlighted with a jointly sponsored daylong forum on freight movement and tourism. This outreach provided many insights into specific transportation related challenges facing WNY. In addition, the study outlined guiding principles to assist the GBNRTC in developing its 2025 Long Range Plan.

Phase II builds upon the accomplishments of the initial effort and gave additional direction during development of the 2025 Long Range Plan. One work item included a survey of private sector employers to determine what transportation enhancements would improve the viability of existing businesses in the region. Economic development officials were also consulted to ascertain which specific development sites would benefit from the provision of better access. In regard to the urban core, meetings were held with planning officials to better understand how transportation infrastructure could assist in the revitalization of the cities of Buffalo and Niagara Falls. In addition, tourism specialists were contacted to initiate a dialogue for coordinating transportation needs as they relate to tourism, including the need for a regional signage program update. And finally, membership recommendations are rendered for consideration should a new GBNRTC economic development subcommittee be established.

If you have any questions regarding this report, please contact:

**Timothy F. Trabold**  
**Principal Transportation Analyst**  
**Greater Buffalo-Niagara Regional Transportation Council**  
**438 Main Street**  
**Buffalo, New York 14202**  
**Email: [ttrabold@gbnrtc.org](mailto:ttrabold@gbnrtc.org)**

**Luke Rich**  
**VP/Regional Director**  
**Empire State Development Corporation**  
**420 Main Street, Suite 717**  
**Buffalo, New York 14202**  
**(716) 856-8123, ext. 223**  
**Email: [nys-westernny@empire.state.ny.us](mailto:nys-westernny@empire.state.ny.us)**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Economic Development Analysis .....</b>	<b>1</b>
• Private Sector Transportation Survey.....	1
• Interviews with Economic Development Officials.....	2
• Revitalization of the Urban Core.....	4
• Economic Development Subcommittee Recommendations.....	5
• Economic Development Analysis Concluding Points.....	6
<b>Tourism .....</b>	<b>7</b>
• Regional Tourism Programs .....	7
• Signage .....	8
- Local Signage Programs	
- Variable Message Signs	
• Tourism Concluding Points .....	10
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Supplemental Research.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	
• Appendix I – Private Sector Survey, complete set of recommendations.....	13
• Appendix II – Economic Development Sites .....	18
• Appendix III – Buffalo Transportation Meeting .....	21
• Appendix IV – Niagara Falls Transportation Meeting .....	24
• Appendix V – NITTEC VMS Meeting.....	25
- Western New York VMS Map.....	27
• Appendix VI – Western New York Web Links .....	28

# ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ANALYSIS

Transportation infrastructure has a significant impact on the region's economic viability. This study builds on the knowledge gained in Phase I, to provide a better understanding of what infrastructure needs to be in place to expand Western New York's business opportunities well into the future. In this effort, staff conducted a private sector survey to reach out and garner opinions from the actual businesses that depend on the infrastructure. Economic development professionals throughout WNY were interviewed to understand which specific development sites could be made more viable by the provision of better access. In addition, meetings were held with planning officials in Buffalo and Niagara Falls to determine what updates needed to take place to revitalize the urban centers of this region.

## Private Sector Transportation Survey

A survey was distributed to Western New York's largest employers, as well as businesses that particularly rely on the regional transportation network, such as custom brokerages and distribution firms. The intent of this undertaking was to garner private sector input for the GBNRTC 2025 Long Range Plan and future planning efforts. The survey asked company representatives to make three specific suggestions for transportation improvements that would help their company grow and prosper in the future.

While there was a wide range of responses, a couple of central themes involving contentious regional issues dominated the survey feedback. Most notably the respondents called for a timely solution to the international bridge debate and for improved rail service. Overall, it was evident that many companies feel some of their transportation costs are higher than necessary and that there is a need for more collaboration to improve Western New York's competitive position. Below is a summary of the survey responses (*A complete list of survey responses is available in Appendix I*).

- International Bridge - The majority of the survey respondents were concerned about the Peace Bridge debate and the persistent congestion at the international bridges. Many of these companies have been directly impacted by congestion problems at the border and are concerned that the back-ups will only worsen over time. In addition, there was fear that eventually a portion of traffic may permanently divert to alternate routes, completely avoiding the Niagara Frontier in the future.

The suggestions provided by the respondents included the timely construction of a new bridge that would handle truck traffic exclusively, planning for border traffic on a regional basis, and to focus on "opening the border," as the Europeans have done. In addition, there were process recommendations such as, using technology to speed the flow of traffic across the border and the streamlining of customs paperwork processing. Predominantly, the message was to resolve the dispute ASAP and to move forward with implementing additional capacity, as well as other techniques designed to alleviate the congestion.

- Rail Service - In general, the respondent companies expressed displeasure about the area railroad service as well as the rates they are currently being charged. Many underscored the need for rail infrastructure projects to be implemented including a new bridge to complement CP Draw, additional intermodal access points and

storage facilities, and, in general, a more developed regional rail network. It was also suggested that more pressure be put on the railroad companies to enhance service, lower charges and for more inter-railroad collaboration to accomplish these ends.

- Other Survey Results - There were several specific roads and intersections singled out as needing improvement and a few suggestions for adding new thruway/highway interchanges. A number of respondents expressed their support for potential large scale projects such as relocating the Williamsville toll booths between exits 48 and 49, the extension of Route 219 from Springville to Salamanca, and the continued improvement of the region's two airports. Additional recommendations included the extension of the LRRT, putting cars back on Main Street in Downtown Buffalo and developing a tourism rail link between Buffalo and Niagara Falls.

## Interviews with Economic Development Officials

In addition to reaching out to the private sector to learn what transportation improvements would help existing businesses prosper, this analysis also emphasized strategies that would spark new economic development in the region. Interviews were conducted with local economic development officials from both Erie and Niagara counties to learn what development sites could be made more viable by the provision of better transportation access. In carrying out these interviews, officials were also asked to name the top three brownfield sites and top three non-brownfield sites that would most benefit from a change in transportation infrastructure. Also, a few potential transportation projects/issues were identified that would provide more far-reaching economic benefits. Finally, the need for better coordination of funding sources between economic development officials and the GBNRTC will be discussed.

### Brownfield Sites

Western New York has an abundant supply of brownfield sites, particularly in its more urban areas. While these sites were once symbols of industrial vitality, they now lie vacant. Rather than face the possibility of expensive clean-up costs and potential future liability, companies opt instead to develop in greenfields, or worse, completely avert WNY. Brownfields and sprawl have depleted our cities of their resources and forced us to invest in expensive infrastructure that has served to also encourage further sprawl.

In this era of regionalism and anti-sprawl objectives, brownfield redevelopment holds one of the keys to achieving "smart growth." It offers abundant acreage of developable land that is strategically located, often with a portion of the required infrastructure already in place. Furthermore, much of this land is adjacent to WNY's vast waterfront and therefore presents the opportunity for both economic revitalization and enhanced quality of life for residents. Most important to our purposes, brownfields redevelopment maximizes the use of the existing transportation system.

Here are the top brownfield sites in each county that would benefit from better access:

- *Erie County* - The most prominent sites are Bethlehem Steel in Lackawanna, South Buffalo Redevelopment (Union Ship Canal and LTV sites), Spaulding Fibre in Tonawanda and the Tonawanda Street Corridor in Buffalo.

- *Niagara County* - The top brownfield sites in Niagara County are Highland Avenue in Niagara Falls, Roblin Steel in North Tonawanda, and the Triangle Site in North Tonawanda.

#### Other Development Sites

In addition to brownfield sites there are a number of other economic development sites that could benefit from better access.

- Erie County – Important sites include the Mudd Flats in Tonawanda, Aquest site in Grand Island, Bethlehem site in Hamburg, Aquest Sterling site in Orchard Park and the West Seneca Industrial Park.
- Niagara County – Niagara Falls International Airport

#### Potential Transportation Projects/Issues

- The rail overpasses that transverse the William-Clinton industrial corridor in Buffalo are too low to allow the passage of high trailer trucks (i.e. the rail bridges on Clinton Street at New Babcock Street, and on William Street, between New Babcock and Fillmore Avenue).
- A four-lane road going east-west was identified as being beneficial to industrial corridors in Niagara County. Perhaps widening Route 31 would accommodate this need. While Route 31 links to the I-190 to the west, it would be advantageous to have a connection to the I-90 at some point to the east.
- Niagara County needs a better truck route to circumnavigate Lockport.
- Linking Vantage Industrial Park with Lehigh Valley Rail Yard, for intermodal access, via a new road that would pass through an old rail right-of-way.
- Linking Route 531 from Rochester west, through Monroe and Orleans County and into Niagara County, eventually connecting with the Lewiston-Queenston Bridge.

#### Coordination between the GBNRTC and Economic Development Officials

While the scope of some transportation projects may provide improved access to and from an industrial park, there is also a need for transportation improvements within a particular site. Herein lies an opportunity to coordinate the GBNRTC's Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) with New York State's Industrial Access Program (IAP).

The IAP offers assistance to economic development efforts where transportation access poses a problem. Eligible work includes design, acquisition of property, public access road construction or reconstruction, curbing, sidewalks, lighting, traffic control and safety devices, drainage systems, landscaping and similar work that may facilitate industrial access. Awards are made on a 60 percent grant and 40 percent interest-free loan basis.

Eligible IAP applicants include municipalities, industrial development agencies, or other governmental agencies involved in promoting economic development. The most significant criterion in the selection process is the number of jobs created and/or retained per dollar of IAP funds invested. The IAP is administered by the New York State Department of Transportation.

Regional economic development officials should coordinate with the GBNRTC to determine which transportation projects are appropriate for IAP funding and which are more suitably financed through the GBNRTC.

## Revitalization of the Urban Core

One of the foremost goals of the GBNRTC is to help revitalize the urban core of Western New York. Meetings were held with the cities of Buffalo and Niagara Falls in order to better understand how transportation infrastructure could assist this process. The initial thrust of this effort was to identify the deficient infrastructure existing in areas where industrial use is planned and to determine whether this infrastructure needed to be either removed or upgraded to better accommodate existing businesses, as well as new ones seeking to locate in these corridors. At both meetings, it was evident that the cities were currently focused on particular projects rather than broader land-use issues, although Buffalo is presently working on a Strategic Master Plan that will include land-use. Therefore, the focus of these meetings turned to various transportation projects and other ventures that would benefit from new transportation infrastructure.

- City of Buffalo – The projects discussed included the Union Ship Canal, the Tonawanda Street Corridor, South Buffalo Connector, CP Draw Railroad bridge, extension of Route 219, Kensington Expressway interchange at William Gaiter Parkway, and the re-configuration of Fuhrmann Boulevard.
- City of Niagara Falls – The projects discussed included the Highland Avenue Redevelopment Project, extension of John B. Daley Boulevard (Quay Street) to Pine Avenue, LaSalle High School and Johnson site, the Royal Avenue and 47<sup>th</sup> Street Corridor, 10 acre railroad site northeast of Niagara Falls off New Road, “Forest Glen” Cherokee Site, New York Power Authority Site, and Love Canal Industrial Park.

*Note: Detailed notes from these meetings are provided as Appendix III (Buffalo) and IV (Niagara Falls).*

## Economic Development Subcommittee Recommendations

Following the success of the Phase I forums, the GBNRTC has contemplated the establishment of a new subcommittee specifically to advise the membership on economic development issues as they relate to transportation infrastructure. Below is a recommended listing of local economic development/transportation experts representing a cross-section of professional affiliations. The main group of experts should be limited to a reasonable number to insure that every person has ample opportunity to contribute to the discussions. Depending upon the specific subject at hand, some members of the recommended group may be exchanged for more appropriate experts on the alternate list. The list was developed primarily from those participants from the Phase I Freight Movement and Tourism forums and respondents to the Phase II *Private Sector Survey*.

### **Recommended**

Bob Dimmig	Eastern Border Transportation Coalition
Irv Rubin	Tonawanda Development Corporation
John Stenson	Bestway Distribution
Jo Nasoff	Erie County Industrial Development Corporation
Dave Chiazza	Ciminelli Cowper
Jim Phillips	CAN/AM
Dan Barry	Buffalo Economic Renaissance Corporation
Pat Whalen	Fulfillment Systems International
Natalie Harder	Continental One
Andrew Giarrizzo	NYS OPRHP - Prospect Park
David Lacki	Greater Buffalo Convention and Visitors Bureau

Holly Sinnott	Niagara World Trade Center
Jean-Claude Thill	SUNY at Buffalo
Dave Sweetman	Nabisco Foods Co., Milkbone Bakery
Ann Conable	Cultural Tourism Group
Leman Bown	Tower Group International

### **Alternates**

Robert Shibley	SUNY at Buffalo
James Golding	Franklin Traffic Services
Marc Gonzales	Buffalo World Trade
Charles Kettner	C.H. Robinson Co
Frank Bartenstein	A.N. Deringer
Thomas Trimble	Consultant
Sandy White	City of Buffalo, Office of Strategic Planning
John Courtin	Martin House Restoration Corp.
Gil Senger	Buffalo Newspress, Inc.
Joseph Cipolla	Bella Vista Group, Inc
Donna McGraw	Quebecor World Buffalo
Stephen Schlabach	Outokumpu American Brass
Paul A. Jusko	National Fuel Gas
Thomas F. Feeney	Occidental Chemical Corp.
Tammy L. Tiutiunnyk	Delphi Harrison Thermal Systems
Brian S. Graham	Cooper Turbo Compressor
Paul Irving	Cataract Customhouse Brokerage Inc.

## Economic Development Analysis Concluding Points

- ◆ The bi-national region of Niagara must persist in efforts to expedite the flow of traffic at the border, in particular reaching a resolution for the Peace Bridge debate. The increasing cross-border traffic should represent new economic development opportunities, yet if the congestion keeps getting worse, much of this traffic may be diverted to other crossings.
- ◆ Railroad infrastructure and collaboration must be augmented to lower rail shipping prices, while increasing the service level to area businesses.
- ◆ Brownfield redevelopment and the revitalization of the urban core are both critical to building a sustainable future for WNY. As the region seeks to make more land available for economic development, the redevelopment of brownfields can play an important role in this process by maximizing the usage of the current transportation system. In addition, revamping infrastructure in the urban core, including the provision of better access for brownfields, will assist in meeting these ends.
- ◆ Enhanced coordination is desirable between the GBNRTC and economic development officials, to ascertain which economic development related transportation projects should be funded by the GBNRTC and which may be eligible for funding through the IAP.
- ◆ While much of the region is focused on specific projects, it is important to have a macro and long-term outlook on land-use and transportation policies. Transportation planning should play a critical role in the region's land-use planning and vice-versa. In addition, regional coordination of land-use policy, economic development and transportation planning is imperative for the future of Western New York.
- ◆ A new economic development subcommittee appears to be an agreeable means to insure that a regular coordination of economic development, tourism and transportation agencies is maintained and nurtured.

# TOURISM

Tourism is one of the fastest growing industries in the world and the leadership of Western New York recognizes its emerging significance. Recently, several new initiatives have broadened the area's tourism efforts to a more regional outlook. The central concept behind these efforts is that linking visitors to multiple attractions throughout the region will increase the average length of stay and the number of visitors to WNY – thus bringing more money into the regional economy. In essence, the whole of WNY's regional tourism industry will truly be greater than the sum of its parts if the necessary linkages are developed both from an infrastructure and a marketing perspective.

Staff conducted interviews with tourism officials to obtain a general understanding of the region's tourism efforts and to explore grounds for future collaboration between the GBNRTC and tourism program administrators. In addition, officials were asked their opinion regarding the need for an update to the regional signage program.

## Regional Tourism Programs

- The Cultural Tourism Program is a jointly funded effort by Erie County, Niagara County and Empire State Development aimed at marketing tourism packages on a regional basis. One of its biggest issues will be how to link the many attractions in the Niagara Region in an organized manner. Some ideas include bus tours, theaters weekends, and wine-and-gallery packages.

A specific example of this challenge is how to link and market the attractions in the Olmstead Crescent. The Crescent includes several draws including Delaware Park, Buffalo Zoo, Albright-Knox Art Gallery, Darwin Martin House, Richardson Complex, Penney-Burchfield Art Gallery and Forest Lawn. How do we bring people to the Crescent and then coordinate their visits so that they are aware of all the attractions and are able to easily navigate their way through the area to visit each one? Can visitors be transported from their hotels by shuttle services or Metro Bus, and then can a walking tour be designed to appropriately showcase the area? In addition, this planning can sometimes take on specific issues, such as how to limit the disturbance to the residential neighborhood surrounding the Darwin Martin House.

- Rethinking the Niagara Frontier is a bi-national collaborative approach to build on our region's extensive heritage. Initially this effort strives to develop a heritage tourism plan that will connect our history and many attractions in an organized fashion starting with our most significant international destination, Niagara Falls. Eventually, this effort hopes to transcend heritage tourism and use the garnered momentum to collaborate on other important regional issues.

Both the Cultural Tourism Program and the Rethinking the Niagara Frontier initiative offer partners that the GBNRTC can collaborate with in order to advance the transportation needs for our region's tourism industry. The GBNRTC should continue to involve itself in the activities sponsored by these groups, and likewise seek ways incorporate their participation in GBNRTC planning ventures as appropriate.

## Signage

In speaking with a number of local tourism professionals, all agreed that a new regional signage program is essential. Making our region user-friendly would provide visitors with a more enjoyable stay. Remember, a tourist who becomes lost and frustrated is not only unlikely to return, but even less likely to promote WNY as a great place to visit. Our region cannot afford such advertising.

Planning a new regional signage program could take place as a collaborative effort between the two tourism groups mentioned above and with the support of the GBNRTC. Perhaps a committee could be formed between these groups to undertake this task.

Among the items that should be considered by such a committee are the integration of local signage programs and the role of Variable Message Signs.

### Local Signage Programs

- The NYS Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (OPR), is working on a new signage program for the NYS Heritage Areas, in accordance with the NYS Department of Transportation's signage guidelines. The new design should be out this year. Currently, WNY has two NYS Heritage Areas within the region, Downtown Buffalo's Theater District and the Western Erie Canal Heritage Area. Therefore, future signage relating to these areas will be updated and a new regional signage program should be coordinated to best complement their design.
- In 1998, the City of Niagara Falls embarked on a new signage program to help direct tourists to different downtown destinations. A numbering system was put in place at major intersections that indicates what attractions and services are located within a block or two. Tourists can only comprehend this if they have a key map, which was initially planned to be printed as part of the 1998 Niagara County Visitors Guide. However, the program got off to a rocky start when the signs were not finished by the time the guides were published. Since, the map was not included in the Visitors Guide, once the signs were completed tourists did not have a map available to make sense out of the new signage system.

A key map was eventually developed, however, the system has yet to provide much benefit. It has only been moderately helpful, while also being somewhat confusing. Still, there has been a large public investment in the signs and if the program is tweaked, there may yet be potential to assist the tourists. Since Niagara Falls is our region's most prized attraction, improving its downtown signage program and integrating it into the larger regional system is of paramount importance.

- Variable Message Signs  
One transportation tool that may provide an opportunity to assist in promoting area tourism venues is the Variable Message Sign (VMS) network. Part of Western New York's (WNY) Intelligent Transportation System (ITS), Variable Message Signs are electronic boards that are situated above highways to communicate important information to motorists. Currently there are 20 VMSs in the region, mainly located on the I-90, I-190 and I-290.

The VMS network in WNY is considered by many to be underutilized. While these signs are generally used to notify drivers of special road conditions and emergencies, the

signs are left blank during prolonged periods of time when there are no traffic alerts. Therefore, there may be an opportunity to promote area attractions when the signs are not being used.

Staff met with officials from the Niagara International Transportation Technology Coalition (NITTEC), the agency that controls the VMS network in WNY, to better understand the operation of the signs and to explore the prospects for further utilization of these devices.

In general, NITTEC's VMS policy allows the signs only to be used for emergency purposes and traffic alerts. NITTEC feels that if VMSs consistently display a particular message, drivers who regularly travel these routes will begin to ignore the signs. Therefore, when a warning is shown, appropriate responses will not be taken by commuters. In terms of promoting tourism, NITTEC's only exception would be for special events that are large enough to have a noticeable impact on traffic flow (A more detailed outline of NITTEC's VMS policy, including a local VMS map, is presented in Appendix V).

While some ITS agencies have similar views regarding their VMS policy (such as Caltrans), others conflict with NITTEC's. In speaking with an employee from the Ontario Ministry of Transportation (OMT), although OMT restricts messages to safety concerns and traffic alerts, their approach is to always have some message displayed – during periods of no traffic alerts they may display a message such as “Buckle Up for Safety.” They feel that since such a large public investment was made, if the signs are underutilized it may generate public disapproval. Currently, OMT is studying the possibility raising revenue by displaying advertisements on their VMSs during periods without traffic problems. The study is nearing completion but is not available to the public at this time.

Since such an idealistic debate on VMS usage exists, it may be appropriate to develop empirical evidence regarding how drivers respond to various VMS programs. In WNY any suggestions for changes in VMS programming would need to go to NITTEC and actual changes will most likely need to be approved by the NYS Department of Transportation and NYS Thruway Authority, the agencies that own the boards. At a minimum, a more thorough discussion of NITTEC's VMS policy is warranted, and ideally an exploration into a broadened usage of the region's VMS. And given the GBNRTC's involvement in funding a portion of NITTEC's annual operations, it would be reasonable for the GBNRTC to review NITTEC policies for consistency and adaptation to implement the goals and objectives of the regional 2025 Long Range Transportation Plan.

For further information regarding Ontario's and/or California's ITS policy, please contact:

- John Proctor  
Ontario Ministry of Transportation  
905-637-4108
- Celso Izquierdo  
Caltrans Traffic Operations, Office of ITS Development and Support, Electronic  
Systems Branch  
916-653-0947

*A more detailed outline on NITTEC's VMS policy, including a local VMS map, is detailed in Appendix V.*

## Tourism Concluding Points

- ◆ The Cultural Tourism Program and Rethinking the Niagara Frontier efforts offer the GBNRTC two partners to collaborate with in matching its transportation infrastructure efforts with the growing tourism industry.
- ◆ Signage is a big issue for Western New York and more planning and coordination that should eventually lead to a new, more understandable, regional signage program.
- ◆ Currently, Variable Message Signs in the area are currently limited to traffic alerts. However, many believe that the VMSs are an underutilized resource and could also be effectively used to promote events and/or attractions in the region, without impacting their primary function. More study and collaboration is needed to determine if such an integrated usage is possible.

## CONCLUSION

As the global competition continues to induce regional partnerships, the bi-national Niagara Region must work toward developing interrelated transportation, economic development and land-use planning. As a regional agency, the GBNRTC must continue to build relationships that will foster such coordinated regional growth.

The results of the private sector survey identified a concern for better freight movement in Western New York, especially in crossing the international bridges in the region. There is an opportunity to better utilize our infrastructure using regional planning methods for cross-border traffic. However, this planning should not only concentrate on traffic flow, but also on how WNY can capture this traffic for economic development purposes, such as opening up strategically positioned developable land, especially brownfields, that would be attractive to companies involved in U.S.-Canadian trade.

It is important to keep in mind that the transportation infrastructure used for freight movement is the same that is used for transporting tourists, thereby creating an integral planning link between both economic interests. The tourism industry is one of the fastest growing segments of the economy, particularly cultural heritage tourism. By working with the new regional tourism groups, the GBNRTC will be able to better assist the growth of tourism in the region.

## SUPPLEMENTAL RESEARCH

In addition to the items documented in this report, staff has worked with the GBNRTC to develop a GIS Economic Development/Transportation Infrastructure Map. The map will demonstrate the relationship between incentives made to companies by economic development agencies and transportation infrastructure investment, during the five-year period between January 1995 and December 1999 using Geographic Information System technology (GIS).

To date, staff has collected economic incentive data from Empire State Development, Erie County Industrial Development Agency and the Niagara County Industrial Development Agency. This data still must be structured into a form that is compatible with GIS software. At that point the data will be forwarded to GBNRTC staff for input and map production. The mapping work has proved to be a formidable task and is still under development.

## Appendix I - Private Sector Survey, complete set of recommendations

### International Bridge Crossings

- Get the Peace Bridge Project done, with new plazas and procedures to move trucks. Moving trucks faster is solution to pollution in resident neighborhoods. (Bethlehem Steel – Lackawanna Coke Division)
- Add more toll collectors, customs inspectors, and booths at both ends of Peace Bridge – not a new bridge. (Buffalo Newspress, Inc.)
- Starting with the Peace Bridge, working north to the Grand Island Bridges, and to the Lewiston Bridge. International transportation is essential to the growth of WNY. If development isn't concentrated on coordinating traffic flow through/over these bridges and through WNY as a whole, other areas/states will be used, leaving WNY out in the cold. (Cataract Customs Brokerage, Inc.)
- A current bottleneck that creates much frustration is the border crossing points. With a large supplier base located in Michigan, the most efficient way to move freight is through Canada. One of the problems we have encountered is the truck congestion associated with all bridge crossing into the WNY region. Perhaps one way to alleviate this disturbance would be to construct a bridge, which would specifically handle all in and outbound border crossing truck traffic. (Delphi Harrison Thermal Systems)
- Must move forward with the Peace Bridge expansion. We ship to 2 locations in Canada and the bridge delays sometimes cost us excess transportation. (Ford Motor Company – Buffalo Stamping)
- Expediate custom clearance at the Canadian/ U.S. border crossings. (McGard Inc.)
- Increase bridge capacity between Buffalo and Fort Erie. Settle the bridge dispute and get on with it. (M&T Bank)
- Look for a solution to the continual back-up of trailer traffic on the bridges to/from the US and Canada. We have quadrupled our inbounds from Canada and we are still seeing delays at the border due to traffic and inspections. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Resolve/ build the Peace Bridge alternative. (National Fuel Gas)
- Implement the best regional solution to improve trailer traffic at the bridges into and out of Canada. We have had enough debate, it is time to pick a solution and implement. (Occidental Chemical Corp.)
- Separate bridge for commercial truck traffic between US and Canada. (Outkumpu American Brass)
- Focus significant efforts to “open the US/ Canadian border” to improve overall regional commerce. (Quebecor World Buffalo)
- Resolve the Peace Bridge issue. (Tower Group International)
- Expedited bridge crossings to Canada – this isn't all a transportation issue since part (most?) of the problem is customs and paperwork issues. (Washington Mills Electro Minerals Corp.)

### Railroad issues/suggestions mentioned in the survey results

- Complete a new bridge to complement CP Draw. (Bethlehem Steel)
- Make Western New York a shared asset railroad. CSX and NFS. (Buffalo Distribution)
- The CP Draw, which is the only access over the Buffalo River, is controlled by one railroad (CSX). We use both NS and CSX to ship and to receive. This causes delays to us when the priority falls to CSX. (Ford Motor Company – Buffalo Stamping)
- We need Buffalo to become a major transportation hub for rail. Most of the switching is done in Ohio, which causes delays when that area gets congested. The switching must be done here. This will also reduce outbound transit times. (Ford Motor Company – Buffalo Stamping)
- Need to have the regional businesses leverage their collective bargaining power on the railroads (CSX, NS, BNSF, etc.) to help decrease the demurrage charges. Our tariff rates just increased over 30% and we have no other source to turn to for our rail service. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Need to increase the number of rail storage yards within the region to help with overflow issues. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Need to increase the intermodal access points within the region. We have increased our intermodal transportation and there needs to be an increase in the number of loading points and a modernization of these facilities. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Need to increase the number of rail routes within the area. Currently there are too few “Main Lines” that service the area. If the “Main Line” to our service area is busy and our train cannot gain access to it, then we do not get our switch that day (or it is delayed to the evening). By increasing the number of lines within the system, we could better utilize the entire network to relieve higher traffic lanes on any given day. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Need to help the carriers in the area by creating “Drop Lots” for their spare equipment. The Buffalo market is very poor in attracting carriers due to the fact that there is poor storage for their equipment and this lane is not productive. Typically, carriers have to either “dead-head” into or out of the Buffalo market due to a lack of business. (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)
- Debottleneck Bison rail yard and upgrade bypass routes so rail service to Niagara Falls doesn’t go through Bison, it goes through Frontier. (Occidental Chemical Corp.)
- Implement Commissioner Ferraro’s identified railroad improvement projects in Niagara County. (Occidental Chemical Corp.)
- Press NS and CSX for projects which will continue to increase local average train speed to reduce rail turnaround, which will lower shipping costs. (Occidental Chemical Corp.)
- Rail access to Niagara Falls, NY for more than one railroad. Absent a competitor that could get to Niagara Falls, lower reciprocal switching fees. (Washington Mills Electro Minerals Corp.)
- Evidently there is only one bridge that CSX has to get eastbound rail traffic over the Buffalo Creek. This is the bottleneck in their system and causes delays on their ability to get rail cars to D.L.W. Railroad who bring the cars to our building in Lancaster, NY. These delays, along with poor service in general from CSX and NS have cost our company \$\$ since the merger. (Whiting Door Manufacturing Corp.)

### Road Projects

- Widen Transit Rd. (Rte. 78) in Village of Depew, especially between Walden Ave. and Broadway (Bella Vista Group, Inc.)
- Widen Pavement Road and Genesee Street in Lancaster, possibly as part of a north/south corridor proposal. (Bella Vista Group, Inc.)
- We are told by our trucking carriers they have difficulty getting onto Union Road from Broadway with our oversize loads. (Cooper Turbo Compression)
- Widen intersection at Military Rd. and Hertel Ave. (Outkumpu American Brass)
- Local issue: Extend Taylor Rd. in Depew, NY to Walden Ave. This would eliminate truck traffic on George Urban Blvd. and provide direct access to the NYS Thruway. (Quebecor World Buffalo)
- Improve signal performance for trucks northbound on Elmwood Ave. attempting to turn into our driveway – left turn arrow! Improve turning radiuses of concrete approach for same driveway entrance (Protective Closures Co., Caplugs Division)
- Provide legal route for 53 foot trailered trucks to arrive at our site. Repave Hinman Ave. and make it heavy truck accessible. (Protective Closures Co., Caplugs Division)
- Related to suggestion 1 – obtain an easement to drive along our south end of property to allow trucks to enter our property. Currently, a truck entrance for Home Depot, etc. Approach to our property would need repair but it could eliminate truck traffic at our south driveway, mentioned in #1 above. (Protective Closures Co., Caplugs Division)
- Keep the City on track with the street improvements for our 3-year plan with the drop lot (i.e. the widening of the street that feeds Feugeron). (Nabisco Foods Company – Buffalo Milkbone Bakery)

### Interchange/Access Recommendations

- Provide thruway access at Gunville Road – Lancaster/Clarence – or even farther east. (Bella Vista Group, Inc.)
- The NYS Thruway Authority is currently considering moving the Williamsville Toll Plaza to a new location east, between exit 49 and exit 48A. Regardless of where it ends up, this community needs an interchange (exit) closer to its west. Perhaps Gunville Road will work or near Ransom Road, near the Clarence/ Newstead line. (Whiting Door Manufacturing Corp.)
- Have an exit/entrance for Broadway off/onto the Thruway (I-90). This would ease traffic congestion Walden Ave. and make it easier to ship and receive product at Cooper Turbo Compression at 3101 Broadway. Also would help out the businesses on Ludwic, which runs parallel with I-90 and off Broadway. (Cooper Turbo Compression)
- Seneca Street needs an on-ramp to Interstate 190 south. Interstate 190 needs an off-ramp to Seneca Street heading north on 190. We have no easy way to get to the NYS Thruway. Very tight side streets. (Fierle Distribution Corp.)

### Large Project Recommendations

- What is happening with the 219 Extension Project? Freight carriers have very little choice in moving goods south. This project needs to move forward. (Cataract Customs Brokerage, Inc.)
- Complete the Route 219 Expressway from Springville south. (National Fuel Gas)
- Move toll barrier on I-90 to a point between exit 49 and exit 48. (Outkumpu American Brass)

- Expand the Kensington Expressway to handle more traffic. (National Fuel Gas)
- Resolve the highway bottleneck, create a new/direct North/South corridor. (National Fuel Gas)
- Develop a truck route other than Route 93 through the Village of Akron. There are many tight turns along 93 and the longer trucks have difficulty negotiating this route. (Whiting Door Manufacturing Corp.)
- Upgrade Father Baker Bridge Complex to handle maximum tonnages (i.e. R-permits). (Bethlehem Steel – Lackawanna Coke Division)

#### Air Transportation

- Encourage more wide body airlift capacity out of the Buffalo International Airport with existing and new air carriers. (Quebecor World Buffalo)
- Niagara Falls International Airport. This transportation resource is being wasted. When is the state going to recognize this and come up with a plan to utilize it? The international designation of the airport would boost economic activity throughout WNY with very little impact downstate, if any at all. (Cataract Customs Brokerage, Inc.)
- Continue expansion of the airport, with the viable amenities to support the same. (National Fuel Gas)

#### General Transportation Recommendations

- Rail service and overall availability of trucks need to be positively influenced. (Quebecor World Buffalo)
- Transportation costs out of and into WNY are too high. We need to work with the railroad and trucking firms, and local and state governments, to lower the costs of shipping products and raw materials. These costs hurt WNY's competitive position relative to other parts of the U.S. (Occidental Chemical Corporation)
- Eliminate NYS Thruway tolls around Metro Buffalo and all of NYS. (Buffalo Newspress, Inc.)
- Speaking with several of the road drivers, one comment was made specific to right turning lanes. A common problem for most truck drivers is the fact that not much room is available for drivers to perform a right hand turn. For example, truck A is currently on street 1 and wishes to make a right hand turn onto street 2. At this intersection a vehicle is waiting to make a left hand turn onto street 1 - the vehicle may need to move, so the truck is able to complete the turn. This is a common problem around the entire WNY area. (Delphi Harrison Thermal Systems)

#### Non-Freight Recommendations

- Establish rail link for passenger traffic between Niagara Falls, Ontario and Buffalo, providing frequent service geared toward luring Falls visitors to Buffalo. (M&T Bank)
- Develop and implement program which puts cars back on Main Street in Downtown Buffalo, alongside light rail (i.e. share Main St.), improving downtown access and sparking redevelopment. (M&T Bank)
- Extend subway to airport and Boulevard Mall. (Buffalo Newspress, Inc.)

#### Road Design and Materials

- Design intersections with concrete in lieu of asphalt. Asphalt intersections "rut and shove," creating unsafe conditions. It also costs more based on a life cycle cost due to early failure and maintenance cost. (Riefler Concrete Products LLC)
- "White-topping." Repair and overlay an asphalt road and/or intersection using a thin section of concrete. Again, this method is less expensive based on life-cycle cost

and provides a safer pavement for the traveling public. (Riefler Concrete Products LLC)

- Electronic transfer of engineered precast drawings for New York State DOT projects. These drawings must be reviewed and approved prior to production. The current process is manual and extremely time consuming. (Riefler Concrete Products LLC)

## Appendix II - Economic Development Sites

### *Erie County*

#### Brownfields

1. Bethlehem (Terry Paquinn, Jo Nasoff & Ken Swanekamp)
  - There are currently plans to redevelop first 110 acres
  - Needs needs everything, nothing existing is reusable - rail relocation, new internal roads, sewers, utilities, etc.
2. South Buffalo Redevelopment Plan - Union Ship Canal, LTV Site – (Terry Paquinn, Jo Nasoff & Ken Swanekamp)
  - Both Union Ship Canal and LTV sites need everything infrastructure-wise
3. Spaulding Fibre Site (Terry Paquinn, Jo Nasoff & Ken Swanekamp)
  - The site is approximately 47 acres
  - There is an at-grade rail crossing that may need to be dealt with, but may be difficult as it is very tight to Military Road and correcting it may make it too steep for trucks.
  - Site is surrounded by residential yet zoned for heavy industrial
  - Site is being studied by the Spaulding Task Force – the study is sponsored by Swanik and Schimminger. This report will come up with a number of reuse options that will fit both the community's and site's needs. However, the site has generated the interest of a developer and the study has been suspended for 90 days while the interested developer does the due diligence in order to decide to purchase and develop the site
  - The main building on the site is 100,000 square feet and there are a few ancillary structures
  - Needs better access
4. Tonawanda Street Corridor (Terry Paquinn)
  - Rail overpasses need to be realigned and /or torn down. In addition, the roads and turning radiuses need widening.
  - A study for the site has been completed. Terry Paquinn was to and inform whether or not it is available to review.

#### Other Economic Development Sites

1. Mudd Flats (Ken Swanekamp & Jo Nasoff)
  - Site is approximately 80 acres and is located north of 290 and west of Military Road in Tonawanda
  - Lacks internal accessibility and infrastructure
2. Grand Island Aquest Site (Ken Swanekamp)
  - 150 acre site west of I-190
  - The site may be partially developed, but 150 acres are available but inaccessible
  - Lacks internal accessibility and infrastructure

3. Hamburg Bethlehem Site (Ken Swanekamp)
  - 145 acres - off Route 5, south of Ford Plant
  - Single owner – UAW credit union is on the site but is separate
  - Lacks internal accessibility and infrastructure
4. Aquest Sterling IP Site (Ken Swanekamp)
  - 150 acres, 40 – 50 acres are already developed and owned by Mentholatham
  - Milestrip Road at the 219
  - Lacks internal accessibility and infrastructure
5. West Seneca Industrial Park – NA Center (Jo Nasoff)
  - Approximately 400 acres
  - Lacks internal accessibility and infrastructure

#### Potential Transportation Projects/Issues

1. The rail overpasses that transverse the William-Clinton industrial corridor in Buffalo are too low to allow the passage of high trailer trucks - i.e. the rail bridges on Clinton Street at New Babcock Street, and on William Street, between New Babcock and Fillmore Avenue. (Greg Simon)

### ***Niagara County***

#### Brownfields

1. Roblin Steel (John Simon, Ed Sullivan)
  - North Tonawanda
  - Needs access to River Road
  - Connection to *new* extended LaSalle Expressway
2. Highland Avenue (Ed Sullivan)
  - Niagara Falls
  - Needs relocation of College Avenue, as well as internal roadwork
3. Simon Steel in Lockport (Ed Sullivan)
  - Lockport
  - Needs a bypass to Route 93.
4. Triangle Site (Ed Sullivan)
  - North Tonawanda
  - Possible access to the Twin Cities Memorial Highway via easement.
5. Forest Glen (John Simon)
  - Niagara Falls
  - Connection to *new* Whirlpool Bridge truck passage (John Simon)
6. Oxy/Durez (John Simon)
  - North Tonawanda
  - Connection to *new* extended LaSalle Expressway (John Simon)

#### Other Economic Development Site

1. Niagara Falls Airport (John Simon)
  - Wheatfield
  - Commercial/Non-Commercial access directly off of the I-190

#### Potential Transportation Projects/Issues

1. Whirlpool Bridge (John Simon)
2. Resurfacing upper level of bridge and connecting roadway with the I-190
3. Linking Route 31 East/ West to 531 (John Simon)
4. Linking of 531 west to either 31 or a *new* east/west highway to Whirlpool Bridge or Lewiston/Queenston Bridge (John Simon)
5. Better truck route to circumnavigate Lockport (John Simon)
6. Link Vantage Industrial Park with Lehigh Valley Rail Yard, for intermodal access, via a new road that would pass through an old rail right-of-way (John Simon).
7. A four lane road going east-west would be beneficial to industrial corridors in Niagara County. Perhaps widening Route 31 would accommodate this need (Dave Mingoia). While Route 31 links to the I-190 to the west, it would be advantageous to have a connection to the I-90 at some point to the east (Ed Sullivan).

## Appendix III - Buffalo Transportation Meeting – October 16, 2000

Attendees: Dan Kreuz Buffalo Dept. Public Works  
 Gary Witulski Buffalo Div. of Strategic Planning  
 Mike Ball Buffalo Economic Renaissance Corp.  
 John Fell Empire State Development

The goal of the meeting was to supplement the current collaboration between the City and the Greater Buffalo-Niagara Regional Transportation Council (GBNRTC), in developing the Buffalo Master Plan and the GBNRTC 2025 Long Range Plan. In particular, we wanted to identify the areas of the City where industrial use is planned and to list the deficient infrastructure in these industrial corridors that need to be either removed or upgraded in order to retain existing businesses and to attract new businesses. At the meeting several projects were identified, many of which were already known and others that were in the initial planning stages.

### Established Long Range Plan Objectives for the City of Buffalo

In July 2000, the City of Buffalo's Department of Public Works submitted an unprioritized list that the City requested to be included in the GBNRTC 2025 Long Range Plan. That list is shown on the left. In addition, the City's Community Development Department composed a prior inventory of the City's Long Range Projects – dated May 2000 – which is shown on the right. The projects that overlap are depicted by the lines that correspond to the similar projects as described on each list below.

#### DPW List – July 2000

- Kensington Expressway interchange at William Gaiter Pkwy
- Reconfiguration/reconstruction of Fuhrmann Blvd.
- Outer Harbor Bridge
- Porter Ave. off-ramp, I-190 northbound
- South Buffalo Connector (Tiff St./Route 5/I-190)
- Union Ship Canal access and development
- Vehicle traffic on Main St.
- Tonawanda Street, industrial access and development
- Scajaquada Expressway enhancements
- CP draw railroad bridge
- Buffalo Intermodal Transportation Center
- Porter Ave. beautification/reconstruction (Fort Porter and Front Park restoration)

#### DCD List – May 2000

##### Outer Harbor Development

- Removal of the Skyway
- Fuhrman Blvd. improvements
- New bridge construction (foot of Fuhrmann to Erie St.)
- Reconfiguration of the I-190, possible conversion of I-190 to surface road to handle Skyway traffic

##### Economic Development

- Southtowns Connector
- Route 219 Extension
- Open Main St. to vehicular traffic
- Tonawanda Street Corridor: transportation and site access improvements – industrial development (please refer to enclosure – Tonawanda Street Corridor Plan)

##### Light Rail Rapid Transit Extensions

- Amherst Corridor to North Campus of the SUNYAB
- Southtowns extension
- Airport extension

##### Quality of Life

- Greenways

## Projects Discussed at the Meeting

At the meeting, Mike Ball added the following infrastructure projects to the City's Long Range Plan objectives:

- Inner Harbor - new roads (Prime, Dayton, New Lloyd, Hanover)
- Downtown circulation – traffic flow changes

The following is a list of potential projects that were mentioned at the meeting (some reflect the above lists but provide more details):

- Worthington Business Center, new access roads
- Tonawanda Street Corridor, rail ROWs & access roads (see Tonawanda St. Corridor Plan).
  - 4 priority areas : Niagara and Tonawanda streets to Buffalo Free Trade Complex
  - GM may have an impact, access could improve possibilities
- CSX
  - Intermodal improvements
  - New transflo location
- Intermodal Site (this may be for CSX as listed above) - See ECIDA Rail Committee study
- Central Terminal & Lathrop Street rail area
- Alternative LRRT extension to airport – along existing rail ROWs, enhancing transit oriented development options
- EDZs
  - Union Ship Canal
  - William Gator Pkwy. - connection to the 33. This would involve removing the Bailey interchange and, possibly, the Olympic Street interchange, as these ramps are situated in residential neighborhoods.
  - Possible new EDZ - boundary application due in December 2000 and the State will make a decision thereafter - If awarded, there may be infrastructure needs.
- Gateway Planning – City has a TEA-21 Grant
- Bridge to the Outer Harbor – going through the SEQRA process
- Downtown traffic circulation – includes Ellicott, Huron, Franklin, Washington, 700 block of Main and Tupper.
- Possible connection between Union Ship Canal, Bethlehem Steel property and Lackawanna EDZ
- Possible retail “power center” development in the Union Ship Canal site
- Possible access needs for more market rate housing developments (eg. LaSalle project)
- Synchronize signals on certain streets – need to learn specific streets
- Deficient infrastructure issues – need to learn more of the specific issues here as the relate to improving the access to industrial corridors

In addition, as part of the master planning process, Buffalo is working on a land banking/assemblage strategy that, in part, will establish new industrial zones. There are certain sections of the City where deficient infrastructure and vast swathes of dilapidated

and abandoned structures exist. As the land in these areas is cleared and assembled, developable industrial corridors will be recognized. The City is currently analyzing these areas to ascertain a sensible demolition and redevelopment strategy. As the plan evolves, the need for specific new infrastructure will become clearer. Therefore, the City may work with the GBNRTC and vice-versa to determine what will work best from both city planning and transportation infrastructure planning perspectives.

It is important to remember that cohesive planning and collaboration will remain important even after the 2025 Long Range Plan and the City Master Plan are complete. Therefore, at the end of the meeting it was agreed that this session provided a starting point for increasing the communication lines in order to better coordinate our planning efforts.

## **Appendix IV – Niagara Falls Transportation Meeting – 9/26/2000**

Attendees: Tom DeSantis – Niagara Falls Department of Planning  
John Fell – Empire State Development

### **List of transportation related projects**

1. Highland Avenue Redevelopment Project (currently an EPA pilot project)  
Brownfields redevelopment:
  - College Avenue is to be relocated in order to open up the land in a subdivision fashion, enhancing the redevelopment potential. The new development sites will have excellent highway access as College turns into Witmer Road (Rte. 31), which has an interchange to the I-190 a short distance away.
  - Internal access roads to the individual development sites
2. Other potential redevelopment sites that may have access issues:
  - Redevelopment of LaSalle High School & Johnson Site
  - Royal Ave. and 47<sup>th</sup> St. corridor
  - 10 acre railroad site northeast of Niagara Falls off New Rd.
  - “Forest Glen” Cherokee Site
  - New York Power Authority Site, off Porter
  - Love Canal Industrial Park
3. Re-configuration of Robert Moses Parkway:
  - Downgrading of Parkway to more appropriate “park road”
  - Whirlpool Street combined with Parkway, Main St. to Findley Drive
  - Two lane road north of Findley drive
4. Road Projects:
  - Buffalo Avenue reconstruction – in current TIP
  - Extension of John B. Daley Blvd. (Quay St.) to Pine St.
  - A new intersection at Hyde Park and the Robert Moses Pkwy
  - Lockport St.
  - Porter Rd.
  - Route 31
  - Royal Ave.
  - Airport – Williams Rd. – connect to Niagara Falls Blvd.
5. Other Projects:
  - Relocation of Amtrak Pass Rail Station
  - Pass Rail connection to Airport
  - Downtown Renewal Areas
    - Main St./Lewiston Road
    - 3<sup>rd</sup> St.

## Appendix V - NITTEC VMS Meeting – September 15, 2000

Attendees: Dean Gustafson – ITS Coordinator, NITTEC  
John Fell – Empire State Development

Variable Message Signs (VMS) or Intelligent Transportation System (ITS) boards are electronic signs that are capable of displaying a variety of messages that alert motorists to alter their direction or to take other appropriate actions in order to sustain an optimal traffic flow. These signs represent an integral component of the ITS technology employed by the member agencies of the Niagara International Transportation Technology Coalition (NITTEC). Currently, there are 20 ITS boards in the Western New York (WNY) region (all in Erie County), of which 14 are owned by the New York State Thruway Authority and the remaining 6 by the New York State Department of Transportation (See Figure 1).

- All of the VMSs in WNY are fixed overhead structures, however, future investments will mainly concentrate on acquiring portable ITS boards. One of the primary uses for the portable boards will be to coordinate traffic flow around construction projects. In addition to the advantage of being mobile, the new ITS boards will be significantly less expensive, costing only 10% of the amount of the fixed overhead boards.
- The VMSs and the messages displayed on them are controlled by NITTEC. NITTEC has its regional operations center in Downtown Buffalo where it monitors the traffic flow of the entire region. The agency gets information from the police, police scanners and traffic cameras that are situated at the heavy traffic stretches and connections on the regional transportation network.

NITTEC VMS policy indicates that the signs should only be used for the following reasons:

- To provide emergency or non-routine information
- To provide warning and detour information
- To provide standard route guidance, signing information and supplement static signs
- To display test or exercise displays during low traffic periods
- To provide site specific road/weather information which falls outside the usual expectations of motorists

The VMS policy stipulates that VMSs “shall not display information that does not have a direct impact on traffic flow, such as:”

- Commercial messages
- General weather conditions
- *Public service/ public relations messages*

The central theory behind these use restrictions of VMSs is that the constant use of a board for any particular message (eg. Promotion of a tourist point of interest) may dull the travelers’ attention to the signs, particularly those who regularly travel a certain route. This would be detrimental if a special alert was suddenly displayed on the sign, as people may inadvertently disregard this important information. Therefore, the promotion of

tourism venues or local events is generally not eligible for display on VMSs unless they will have a noticeable effect on the flow of traffic.

#### Traffic Management for Large Events that do have a noticeable effect of traffic flow

VMSs have been utilized for event management in the past, specifically when events are large enough to have an impact on traffic flow. Examples of events that ITS boards have been used for are: the Niagara Air Show, Erie County Fair, some Sabres games, Bills games, and some Dunn Tire Stadium events.

Currently, NITTEC receives an annual list of local special events and maintains some contact with the Greater Buffalo Convention and Visitors Bureau. However, it may be possible to increase the coordination of large events in order to better manage the traffic flow to the events and to simultaneously help promote them.

#### Getting VMS Assistance for Large Events

In terms of the process to obtain VMS assistance, the event organizer must start by obtaining a Mass Gathering Permit from the municipality in which the event will be held – the permit is required for gatherings of over 5,000 people. Once a permit is obtained the organizer must submit a written request to NITTEC for the use of one or more ITS boards to direct traffic to the event. This request should explain 1. what the event is; 2. where the event is to be located; 3. a specific time period for the event; and 4. the number of people that are expected to attend - the more detailed the information the better. Such a request should be sent at least one month prior to the event date in order to properly arrange for the event. If the request is accepted, NITTEC will meet with the event coordinator/committee to organize a traffic management plan.

# Western New York Variable Message Sign Map



## Appendix VI

### Western New York Web Links

#### Local Info

- Buffalo.com - <http://www.buffalo.com/>
- BuffaloAtHome.com - <http://www.buffaloathome.com/>

#### Municipalities

- City of Buffalo - <http://www.ci.buffalo.ny.us/city/index.html>
- City of Niagara Falls - <http://www.ci.niagara-falls.ny.us/>
- Erie County - <http://www.erie.gov/>
- Niagara County - <http://www.niagara-usa.com/development/intro.htm>

#### Business Links

- Empire State Development Corporation - <http://www.empire.state.ny.us/>
- Erie County Industrial Development Agency - <http://ecidany.com/>
- Niagara County Industrial Development Agency - <http://www.ncida.org/>
- Buffalo Economic Renaissance Corporation - <http://www.buffalodevelopment.com/>
- Amherst Industrial Development Agency - <http://www.amherstida.com/index2.htm>
- Lackawanna Empire Development Zone - <http://www.lackawannany.com/>
- Buffalo Niagara Partnership - <http://www.thepartnership.org/>
- Western New York Regional Information Network - <http://www.rin.buffalo.edu/>
- NYSEG - <http://www.nyseg.com/NysegWeb/Main.nsf/Home/NysegHome?OpenDocument>
- World Trade Center Buffalo Niagara - <http://www.wtcbn.org/>
- Build Now NY - <http://www.gorr.state.ny.us/gorr/BuildNow-NY.html>
- WNY Technology Development Center, Inc. - <http://wings.buffalo.edu/wnyt/dc/>
- Shovel Ready.com - <http://www.shovelready.com/>
- NYS Governor's Office for Small Cities - <http://www.nysmallcities.com/>
- Economic Development Administration - <http://www.doc.gov/eda/>
- U.S. Department of Commerce - <http://www.doc.gov/>
- NYSDOT Industrial Access Program - <http://www.dot.state.ny.us/progs/iap.html>

#### Tourism Links

- National Trust for Historic Preservation - <http://www.nthp.org/>
- New York State Canal System - <http://www.canals.state.ny.us/>
- The Urban Design Project - <http://www.ap.buffalo.edu/~rshibley/udp/>
- Travel Industry Association of America - <http://www.tia.org/>
- Waterfront Regeneration Trust Corporation - <http://www.waterfronttrust.com/>
- NYS Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation - <http://nysparks.state.ny.us/>
- Western New York Erie Canal - <http://www.westernny.com/erie.html>
- Travel Industry Links/TIA - <http://www.tia.org/Links/>

#### Transportation Related Sites

- Bureau of Transportation Statistics - <http://www.bts.gov/>
- Continental 1 - <http://www.con1.com/>
- Federal Highway Administration - <http://www.fhwa.dot.gov/>
- The Transportation Equity Act for the 21st Century - <http://www.istea.org/>
- Transportation Research Board - <http://nationalacademies.org/trb/>
- World Trade Centers Association - <http://iserve.wtca.org/>